

June 23, 2022

Dear Chair Randolph and Board Members,

We are the Central Valley Defenders of Clean Air and Water, a group made up of residents of communities living near large industrial dairies. We understand the impact that these dairies have had and continue to have on the health of our communities and our planet. That is why we have serious concerns about CARB's plan for the future of dairies in California as proposed in the *Draft Scoping Plan*. We urge the Board to change course.

The impact that industrial dairies have on our communities is clear:

Dairies are a polluting industry. Dairy biogas is not a source of clean energy. It is a major contributor to methane emissions in California, as well as other greenhouse gas emissions, nitrous oxide, hydrogen sulfide, and ammonia gas. All of that is polluting the air and water in California. The smell of dairies causes headaches, nausea, and brings a lot of flies to our area. Every person deserves to breathe clean air and drink clean water. The most impacted by pollution are people of color and people in disadvantaged communities. We are hardly surviving economically, cannot buy water to drink, and are exposed to all contamination outside on fields and near dairies. A lot of people get Valley Fever, asthma, and cancer when they come to live in the Valley.

- **Nicolas Cisneros, Fuller Acres**

I've lived most of my life in Pixley and spent several years trying to hold state officials accountable for the air and water quality issues in our community. The air we breathe is among the worst in the nation, yet we haven't seen any action from state regulators to control pollution from agriculture and dairy farms in our region...The way that we have to live here with contaminated air and water isn't right. Everybody deserves to drink clean water and breathe clean air. Here in Pixley, we deserve to have a healthy life and to not worry about our families, our children having asthma or skin disorders, or this problem or that due to poor air and water quality.

- **Elena Saldivar, Pixley**

The quality of the water affects me a lot. The city sent us a letter where it says that the drinking water cannot be drunk since it has nitrate and that even if we boil it, it is not drinkable for consumption. Will they give funding to investigate the consequences of drinking this water?

- **Armada Elena, Los Banos**

How would you like to live in a community where in your backyard for 24 hours a day, seven days a week you smell manure? That stink gets into your skin and your clothing, and you go shopping and you smell like cow manure at the store. Those are the realities of the residents in these areas.

- **Patricia Ramos Anderson, Santa Nella**

California has dumped hundreds of millions of dollars and created a lucrative market for these polluters to make polluting gas from dairy manure. The dairy industry claims that this will improve our water and air quality. We know these claims aren't true because some of us are already living near dairies with digesters:

I've been a resident of Pixley, California, since 1967. My worries are about environmental issues since Pixley is surrounded by dairy farms. The smell of manure is overwhelming, especially during the summer and hot days. There are seven dairy farms in Pixley, as well as a digester, that are surrounding the schools in the community.

- **Maria Arevalo, Pixley**

For these reasons, we are alarmed by what is in the *Draft Scoping Plan*. There is no discussion of directly regulating these dairies. Instead, CARB claims that dairy herds need to be *more* concentrated and that dairies will need to install 380 more digesters to meet California's methane emission goals. This is a decision being made by the state to put industry profits over our health and the health of the planet:

The dairies only want to continue to grow their business and their money so they will want to continue growing their herd sizes to get more money. That means more contamination for my community. We are tired that you do not take us into consideration. We have the right to live with clean air and clean water. You do not understand that you are sacrificing my community for the dairy's economic benefit.

- **Minerva Contreras, Lamont**

They're thinking of turning cow manure into fuel. In order for them to do that and be profitable, they would need more cows, and I think that's what they're trying to do. More cows equals more nitrates and more odor sifting through our town.

- **David Rodriguez, Planada**

For these reasons, we call on the Board to reject the *Draft Scoping Plan's* proposal to increase dairy digesters and gas from manure. In order to protect our communities and the planet, CARB must take seriously the impact that these industrial dairies have on our communities. CARB must stop supporting the concentration of dairy herds in our communities and focus on real solutions

that prevent greenhouse gases and pollution from being released into our environment to begin with. We need CARB to directly regulate emissions coming from these dairies to ensure our communities are protected and, at the same time, ensure the largest source of methane in California is directly reduced to prevent the worst impacts from climate change.

Sincerely,

Central Valley Defenders of Clean Air and Water